

PLANNING APPLICATION REPORT

Case Officer: Clare Stewart

Parish: Kingswear **Ward:** Dartmouth and East Dart

Application No: 1953/16/HHO

Agent/Applicant:

Mr Peter Frampton
Oriol House
42 North Bar
Banbury
OX16 0TH

Applicant:

Dr D Burston
C/O Agent

Site Address: Coombe Cottage, Bridge Road, Kingswear, TQ6 0DZ

Development: Householder application for rear extension

Reason item is being put before Committee: The application have been brought to Committee by the Development Management Lead, as the Officer recommendation is contrary to advice given as part of a pre-application enquiry.



Recommendation: Refusal

Reasons for refusal

1. The proposed extension would be incongruous in respect of its design, scale and massing upon the character and appearance of the existing dwelling house and the visual amenities AONB. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to policies CS7 and CS9 of the LDF Core Strategy, policies DP1 and DP2 of the LDF Development Policies DPD and the National Planning Policy Framework.

Key issues for consideration:

Design and scale of development proposed, visual impact in the AONB.

Site Description:

The site is set in the hillside to the west of Kingswear a short distance from the landing stage used by the Higher Ferry, with access taken via a shared lane from Bridge Road. The original dwelling is of some age but has been significantly altered and extended, with external finishes now including render and thatch. The property is set within a large parcel of land that overlooks the River Dart.

The site is located within the South Devon AONB.

The Proposal:

Consent is sought for a rear extension which would sit on top of a previously approved terrace facing the River Dart. The extension would have a two storey central turret, mimicking the form of the existing elevation but extending outwards, with single storey wings on either side. The two storey would extend forward of the main rear elevation of the dwelling by approximately 7.4 metres (compared with the existing turret which extends out by approximately 2.1 metres). The single storey extension elements would extend out from the rear elevation by approximately 5.3 metres, and span a significant width across the rear of the dwelling. The proposed extension would have a thatched roof, with rendered wall to match the main dwelling and hardwood door and windows.

The previously approved ground floor extension (which sits below the terrace) is proposed to be altered with a new door arrangement.

Consultations:

- County Highways Authority – No highways related issues
- South West Water – No further permissions from SWW required
- Environmental Health Section – No objection subject to standard unsuspected contamination condition
- Kingswear Parish Council – Recommend refusal – *“Comment was made:
The size of the development is out of keeping with other properties in the vicinity
Unneighbourly – restricts the outlook for neighbouring properties
Unacceptable for reasons of mass and overdevelopment
Affects the setting within an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty
Similar applications have been refused.”*

Representations:

No letters of representation from third parties have been received.

Relevant Planning History

- 30/1382/15/F: Householder application for ground floor level extension. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 02 Sep 15
- 30/0092/15/F: Householder application for a rear 2 storey extension. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Refusal: 10 Mar 15
- 30/2985/13/F: Householder application for second storey extension over previously approved single-storey extension (previous approval 30/0147/13/F) to rear of dwelling. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 22 Jan 14
- 30/1105/13/F: Householder application for erection of a garage with ancillary accommodation. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 20 Jun 13
- 30/0147/13/F: Householder application for single storey rear extension. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Conditional approval: 21 Feb 13
- 30/2804/12/F: Retrospective application for the erection of a timber garden room with terrace and associated landscaping works. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear Devon TQ6 0DZ. Conditional approval: 13 Feb 13
- 30/2370/12/F: Resubmission of householder application 30/1052/12/F for extension to for conservatory on existing terrace. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 07 Nov 12
- 30/2258/12/F: Retrospective householder planning application for alteration of garden levels and erection of garden retaining walls and swimming pool. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Conditional approval: 23 Nov 12
- 30/1052/12/F: Householder application for extension to form conservatory on existing Terrace. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 30 Jul 12
- 30/ 0183/12/F: Resubmission of planning application 30/3103/11/F for householder application for timber garden room with seating. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear Dartmouth TQ6 0DZ. Conditional approval: 28 Feb 12
- 30/3103/11/F: Householder application for timber garden room with seating. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear TQ6 0DZ. Withdrawn: 16 Jan 12
- 30/0776/88/3: Replace flat roof on two extensions with pitched and thatched roof to match existing private residence. Coombe Cottage Bridge Road Kingswear. Conditional approval: 19 May 88

ANALYSIS

Principle of Development/Sustainability:

The principle of alterations and extension to an existing dwelling raises no objection. Due regard must still be had to all other relevant planning considerations as detailed below.

Design/Landscape:

There has been a succession of proposals granted to extend the property dating a number of years, with the most recent approval in 2013 (LPA ref. 30/0147/13/F). Since then there have been a number of unsuccessful attempts to obtain planning permission for further rear extension. The most recent of these was withdrawn on the advice of Officers, but prior to that an application for a two storey rear extension was refused (LPA ref. 30/0092/15/F). The refused scheme was similar in form to the current proposal, but with the whole extension being two storey in scale.

The current application effectively amends the previously approved scheme by reducing the height of the extension on either side of the central turret to single storey. Whilst the applicant has sought to reduce the reason for refusal of the previous application, Officers consider the scale and massing now proposed would still result in an incongruous addition to the existing property and would harm the appearance and character of the existing dwelling and does not represent good design practice. The application now under consideration is not considered to be substantively different from the previously refused scheme to justify coming to a different conclusion.

The property is highly visible in public views from the River Dart and such an extension of the scale and massing proposed would adversely impact upon the setting of the AONB and local landscape.

Neighbour Amenity:

The proposed extension although of a significant mass and bulk it is not considered to result in any significant impact upon neighbouring properties due to the distances between the properties.

Highways/Access:

No alterations to the existing arrangement are proposed.

Ecology:

The application is accompanied by a Preliminary Ecological Appraisal, Bat Emergence Survey and Mitigation Strategy. Low numbers of bats were observed using the existing dwelling in three locations. These areas would not be directly affected by the proposed development but mitigation measures would still be required. Should the current application be approved, a condition to ensure the mitigation measures were followed would need to be applied to any consent given.

Other Matters:

The application has been advertised as affecting a Public Right of Way. There is a PROW running along the access lane to the north of the dwelling which would not be directly affected by the proposed development.

As noted above the application has been brought to DM Committee by the Development Management Lead as positive advice was given to the scheme during a pre-application enquiry. On this occasion it is considered by Officers that the pre-application advice given was inappropriate, but given that the application was then submitted in good faith taking it to DM Committee (rather than just refusing the application under delegated powers) was the best course of action.

The Planning Balance:

The proposed development does not represent good design and would be visually prominent in the AONB. Other concerns raised by the Parish Council have been given due consideration but are not considered to justify grounds for refusal. On this basis the application is recommended for refusal on design grounds only.

This application has been considered in accordance with Section 38 of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

Planning Policy

NPPF

South Hams LDF Core Strategy

CS1 Location of Development

CS7 Design

CS9 Landscape and Historic Environment

CS10 Nature Conservation

Development Policies DPD

DP1 High Quality Design

DP2 Landscape Character

DP3 Residential Amenity

DP5 Conservation and Wildlife

DP7 Transport, Access & Parking

DP15 Development in the Countryside

DP17 Residential Extensions and Replacement Dwellings in the Countryside

Considerations under Human Rights Act 1998 and Equalities Act 2010

The provisions of the Human Rights Act 1998 and Equalities Act 2010 have been taken into account in reaching the recommendation contained in this report.